

A Comparative Analysis of Voice of America and Al-Jazeera News Organizations Depicts the Picture of Pakistan

Majid Ali Shah¹, Martin A. M. Gansinger²

¹Girne American University, Communication and Media Management (PhD), University Yolu Sk, Cyprus

²Professor, PhD, Girne American University, Communication and Media Management, University Yolu Sk, Cyprus

Abstract: Media is playing a vital role in any country and is being used in many instances to create stereotypes about countries and its people. Today Pakistan is in such a situation where different world media are trying to label Pakistan as a terrorists' place and linking Pakistan with all terrors. It is mostly American media that is promulgating news against Pakistan and showing the bad picture of Pakistan. According to Bernays (1928, p.153) "Propaganda will never die out". This article identify the coverage patterns of Pakistan in light of agenda setting, framing and propaganda theories in two leading English language news organizations Voice of American (VOA) and Al-Jazeera. The news from (VOA) and Al-Jazeera is selected for one month February 2014 for measurement. This research endeavours to present an overview of the image of Pakistan as portraying by the both media organizations. This study conducts content analysis of Al-Jazeera and (VOA). Contents of the news were analyzed separately for the study. This study finds out that (VOA) is quite different in disseminating information about Pakistan while Al-Jazeera is neutral than (VOA). In whole month of February 2014 (VOA) covered Pakistan as a failed state against war on terror and has an opinion that Pakistan is a place for terrorist. (VOA) covered 47 (100%) articles in which 33(70.21%) articles portray the negative image of Pakistan 6(12.76%) news articles are categories in positive while 8(17.02%) news articles are neutrally reported. As compare to (VOA) depiction of Pakistan is not dreadful by Al-Jazeera news organization. "Al-Jazeera" covered Pakistan very neutrally and mostly wording and language used in good turn for Pakistan. Al-Jazeera covered 45 (100%) articles in which 25(55.55%) articles are positive, 20 (44.44%) news stories are neutral while there is no negatively framed news for Pakistan by Al-Jazeera.

Keywords: Agenda setting, propaganda, media framing, Image of Pakistan.

1. Introduction

Media all over the world are busy like a bee in propaganda against each others, setting their agendas and framing different types of news about each other. These media outlets are being played significant roles in building public opinion on the issues by framing and agenda setting techniques. It's quite clear that media organizations are setting their own agenda for their audience and readers. Basic factor in agenda setting is the process of framing the stories.

"Mass communication effects can result from the sheer volume of exposure. First level agenda-setting effects demonstrate that phenomenon. But as both attribute agenda-setting and priming demonstrate, closer attention to the specific content of mass media messages – including the tone of those messages – provides a more detailed understanding of the pictures in our heads and of subsequent attitudes and opinions grounded in those pictures" McCombs (1972).

Poornananda (1998) investigated that third world countries especially South Asian countries coverage in U.S. media was very minor during five years from 1992 to 1996. According to his research study "Coverage of South Asia in two leading U.S. newspapers," he demonstrated that The Los Angeles Times, and The Washington Post, gave very little coverage to South Asia. The given spaces to Asian countries are full of negative stories which were generally based on crimes, disasters, and conflicts and failure of

governments. He claimed that these media outlets are trying to depict the bad picture of Asian countries. Whenever the word "propaganda" is used everybody starts thinking negatively and mostly people have the opinion that propaganda is an instrument of the devil, while some have the opinion that propaganda is to misguide people.

After 9/11 America need Pakistan as a forefront country against Al-Qaeda, which opens another chance for both countries to work together. On one hand America were fighting for democracy In Afghanistan while on another hand United States of American (USA) support military dictator in Pakistan for his national interest not for Pakistan prosperity. After fulfilling of his mission against communism and Al-Qaeda America starts war against Pakistan and threatening the sovereignty of Pakistan. The Nation newspaper (11 May, 2014) "According to District Police Office (DPO) Iftikhar Ahmed, an unmanned US drone fired three missiles on a seminary near Degree College in tehsil Tal of Hangu district in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK)".

According to Tomaselli (1992, p.4) "any attempt at persuasion is propaganda. Because propaganda has both positive and negative connotations, as used in conventional media studies it is too general for useful application". Framing news is a type of propaganda that is the news organizations that they are setting agendas and framing different types of news for different countries. Framing provides a practical way in which to analyze content for dominant themes or central ideas through an empirical

framework. Frame analysis basically allows its user to locate, perceive, identify, and label a seemingly infinite number of concrete occurrences defined in its terms (Goffman, 1974).

Framing news is the mode in which information is presented to its audiences. Goffman was the first to concentrate on framing as a form of communication and defined "framing" as a "schemata of interpretation" that enables individuals to "locate, perceive, identify and label" occurrences or life experiences (Goffman, 1974).

There is no doubt that Pakistan have a bad time since 9th 11 but some media organizations are exaggerating this bad luck era. The pictures of the world are shaped and refined in the way journalists frame their news stories. This function of media is called the agenda setting function of media. Collecting, editing and presenting information into news is a complex job on the part of media people.

When journalist receives information then after that he is going to publish or disseminate according to his own well or according to his organization's well. The well of journalist is called (gate keeping) framing that how he is framing the collected information. Journalist framing may change or alter the opinion of the people. Walter Lippmann 1922 was one of the great journalists having the opinion that what we know about the world is largely based on what the media decide to tell us. So that is the reason that people are relying on media and (VOA) is framing their news stuff like that no one is getting affected in drone attacks in Pakistan only terrorists are dying not civilians, while Al-Jazeera is trying to show that people are protesting about drones and there are plenty anti drones campaigns.

1.1 Aims and Objectives

The aim of this research is to identify propaganda in the news and framing news for Pakistan by doing a comparative analysis of (VOA) and Al-Jazeera. This article identified that the coverage patterns of Pakistan in light of agenda setting and framing theories in two leading English language news organizations (VOA) and Al-Jazeera is quite different from each other. (VOA) and Al-Jazeera news organizations are chosen because they are popular in Pakistan and have a large readership/distribution in all over the world. By using 2 different news organizations it gives us a broader understanding of the issues and a bird's eye view of all sentiments involved in the writing of the news.

2. Literature Review

In an attempt to meet the objectives of this study, this will give an in-depth review of topics related to the study so as to expose critical areas that will meet not only the objectives but also the study problems. According to Terrence, (1965, p. 27) "Propaganda is thus defined as the deliberate attempt by some individual or group to form, control, or alter the attitudes of other groups by the use of the instruments of communication, with the intention that in any given situation the reaction of those so influenced will be that desired by the propagandist. The propagandist is the individual or group who makes any such attempt."

Joseph Obe (2008) cited Lasswell "that the worldwide economic depression and political strife had made people particularly vulnerable to propaganda conveyed by the mass media". (p. 60) Media agenda setting is one of the most important elements involve in disseminating information. Each and every news have different angles and different faces once when journalist find news stuff then after that he will show the same face of that news which he want to show to the world. According to Tony (2014) the most overt example comes in the form of nearly a decade of deadly US drone attacks carried out in Pakistani territory.

Tony (2014) claimed that these attacks have led to over 3,000 killed, a quarter of which have been civilians and constitute an act of war no other nation on Earth would tolerate. While the US claims these operations are "anti-terror" in nature, they appear to be instead a component among a much greater campaign to undermine and destabilize Pakistan politically.

American news organizations set their agendas and framing the reality that drones are killing only militants. "Shaheen had served as interim chief of the Pakistani Taliban after a suspected U.S. drone strike killed former chief Hakimullah Mehsud last year. He was later replaced by the militants' current chief, Mullah Fazlullah." (VOA), February 24, 2014 11:00 AM).

This is the same news about drone attacks that more than 3000 people killed but (VOA) is framing only one person and trying to show different thing. According to this research in February 2014 (VOA) covered only one news story about drone while Al Jazeera produced 4 news stories and all of them are anti drone attacks. Every organization has their own agenda and working accordingly.



The best example of framing is the above picture in reality one person is trying to hit other but what media is showing to the world. The frame of the above picture is the example of (VOA), through this (US) media's framing only militants are killing in drone attacks. According to journeyman.tv media is framing only militant in drone attacks and trying to avoid what is the reality, (<http://www.journeyman.tv/?lid=66218&bid=2>). This is a type of propaganda.

"Propaganda does exist on all sides of us, and it does change our mental pictures of the world. Even if this be unduly pessimistic and that remains to be proved the opinion reflects a tendency that is undoubtedly real. In fact, its use is growing as its efficiency in gaining public support is recognized". (Bernays, 1928, p. 19)

2.1 Brief History of Pakistan

According to Haider (2010) from its inception in 1947, the idea of Pakistan was a contested ideological matter. Having lost their privileged status when the British supplanted India's Mughal rulers, Indian Muslims divided in response to a deepening cultural and political insecurity under colonial rule.

The birth of Pakistan is the story of the birth of an idea. An idea that the Muslim minority of the Indian subcontinent should have a separate state as otherwise the Hindu majority in a united independent India would dominate. The idea became a reality when the British plan to partition the Indian subcontinent led to the creation of the Republic of Pakistan on 14 August 1947.

The founding father, Muhammed Ali Jinnah's original vision was for a secular state for Indian Muslims, modeled on the European concept of the nation-state. On the other hand, Pakistan's national poet, Allama Iqbal, championed a different concept. He envisioned Pakistan as an instrument with the purpose of establishing the Law of the God. This vision prescribed Pakistan as an Islamic state. (IMS, July 2009, p.11)

After 1971 when civil war, with Indian interference, led to the partition of East (Bangladesh) and West Pakistan, national identity shifted. The Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan is the supreme law of Pakistan. Known as the Constitution of 1973, it was drafted by the government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and, following additions by the opposition parties, was approved by the legislative assembly on April 10, 1973. It was Pakistan's first ever constitution by consensus unlike two earlier constitutions, the Constitution of 1956 and the Constitution of 1962. (Amir Khan Goraya, 2010, p.4).

3. Methodology

To measure the nature and frequency of coverage of two leading English language news organizations is been selected as a universe and sampling purposes for content analysis for one month: February, 2014. The rationale behind selecting these news organizations is that both are popular and have the ability and strength to make and mould the public opinion. The employed methodology for this paper is content analysis. Sarantakos (1998) describe content analysis "As a method of the social research, content analysis is a documentary method that aims at both qualitative and quantitative analysis of the content". Eleanor Chelmsky (March 1989) Content analysis is a set of procedures for collecting and organizing information in a standardized format that allows analysts to make inferences about the characteristics and meaning of written and other recorded material. (VOA) and Al-Jazeera were chosen because of popularity in the whole world and having a large readership/distribution, while these news organizations, it would give us a broader understanding of the issues and a bird's eye view of all sentiments involved in the writing of the news.

News article from February 2014 were analyzed in this research article. The categories are the heart of the content analysis. The collection of the data becomes possible and

easy through the construction of the categories. A category in content analysis is a set of criteria or a measure, which are integrated round a theme or a value (Sarantakos, 1998: 281). These categories are as;

a) Terrorism

Articles based on terrorism, Taliban, Al-Qaeda, suicide bombing, terrorist organizations activities; bomb blast and support to terrorism in Pakistan were classified in terrorism.

b) Drone

Articles dealing with Drone attacks or anti drone campaigns are categorized in this category.

c) Politics and Military of Pakistan

All the articles related to political development, Pakistan's foreign relations and restoration of democracy were categorized in politics. Articles related to Pakistan army activities in Pakistan are categorized in this category.

d) Mixed

All the articles which is not placed in the above categories and related to Pakistan are categories in this part. Articles related to Pakistani culture, religion and sectarianism in Pakistan, Education and judiciary etc.

3.1 Value and Direction of the Contents

- A. Whole news story, paragraph, words and pictures which indicate Pakistan as a not cooperated country with NATO forces, Supporting terrorist and anarchy were coded as negative.
- B. Whole news story, paragraph, words and pictures which indicate Pakistan as a good country, economic development, art and culture were hinted as positive.
- C. Whole news story, paragraph, words and pictures which had not any direction and impartially reported were coded as neutral.

3.2 Sampling

In this research the news from (VOA) and Al-Jazeera is considered as sample as the news of the selected media are to be analyzed 2014 whole February month. The unit of analysis in this study is considered to be the words, sentences, paragraphs or even an entire news article, which indicates the presence of one of the categories, published in February month.

3.3 Instruments

This article shall draw upon: Agenda Setting: The theory employed in this paper is agenda setting theory (Miller, 2004) the first one is the media agenda that involves the set of the topics that are addressed by media sources. The second is the public agenda that is related to the set of the topics that the members of the public believe is very important and finally, there is the policy agenda that represents all the issues that the decision-makers (legislators) believe are primarily salient. The present study "A comparative analysis of voice of America and Al-Jazeera news organizations depicts the picture of Pakistan". (Media & propaganda Perspective)" intends to determine the 'Media Agenda' of both news organizations. It intends to examine the priorities of the press in this regard and also to determine the frequency of the coverage of selected issues by the both media organizations. In the study in hand, the researcher has

tried to study that how these media has covered the selected issues in February 2014 and tried to set the desired agenda of the news organizations and how has influenced in setting the agenda moreover it is also determined that how these organizations has portraying the picture of Pakistan and how they are trying to frame deferent news about Pakistan.

4. Data Analysis

This part has analyzed the data with Quantitative findings. Cooperatively articles related to Pakistan published by (VOA) are calculated here for final conclusion. In whole month of February 2014 total numbers of articles related to Pakistan are 47 where 37 (78.72%) articles are published in Category A, Category B 1(2.12%), category C 7(14.89%)

and category D 2(4.25%) articles. These Categories express the direction and coverage of (VOA) that is Negative 33 (70.21%) Positive 6 (12.76%) and Neutral 8 (17.02%)

(VOA) used very strange language and wording for Pakistan. Wording used by (VOA) were calculated separately and not mentioned in tables. (VOA) used the word “Taliban” 269 times in one month while Al-Jazeera used the same word 137 times. The word “militant” was used by (VOA) 109 times, while Al-Jazeera used the same word only 8 times in whole month. According to Al-Jazeera’s agenda the word drone used 38 times and all the news about anti drones attacks, while (VOA) cover only one news story about drone attack and claimed that leader of Taliban killed in that attack.

Table 1: Comparative Direction of Categories for (VOA)

Types of Articles	Total Articles	Frequency	Direction of Articles		
			Positive	Negative	Neutral
A Terrorism	47	37(78.72%)	3(6.38%)	28(59.57%)	6(12.76%)
B Drone Attacks	47	1 (2.12%)	0(0.00%)	1(2.12%)	0(0.00%)
C Politics	47	7 (14.89%)	2(4.25%)	3 (6.38%)	2 (2.12%)
D Mixed	47	2 (4.25%)	1(2.12%)	1(2.12%)	0(0.00%)
Total	47	47 (100%)	6(12.76%)	33(70.21%)	8(17.02%)

According to table 1; that American news organization “(VOA)” covered Pakistan as a fail state against war on terror and have an opinion that Pakistan is a place for terrorist. (VOA) covered 47 (100%) articles in which 33(70.21%) articles portray the negative image of Pakistan 6(12.76%) news articles are categories in positive while 8(17.02%) news articles are neutrally reported.

1; presents that the coverage about drone in Pakistan are covered negatively. There are many protests against drones Al-Jazeera covered 4(8.88%) news articles about anti drone attacks in same period of time.

Calculations of one month news stuff covered by (VOA) in category A, Table 1; showed that article related to terrorism is 37(78.72%) articles 3(6.38%) articles are coded positive 6(12.76%) are neutral while 28(59.57%) are negatively coded. Table 1; illustrate that (VOA) reported 47 news about Pakistan in February in which 1 (2.12%) article is categories in B. Articles related to drone attacks in Pakistan there is only one news stories which is categories negatively. Table

According to table 1; (VOA) covered total 7 (14.89%) articles in category C, in this category 2(4.25%) are reported positive 3 (6.38%) negative while 2 (2.12%) news articles are reported as neutrally. Category D is related to general articles like religious, culture. It is clearly showed that except category C all categories have the obvious ratio of negative image. Cumulative of the result showed that there is major relation of negative image of Pakistan. (VOA) sets his agenda for Pakistan to depict the country as a terrorist and bad place in all over the world.

Table 2: Comparative Direction of Categories for Al-Jazeera

Types of Articles	Total Articles	Frequency	Direction of Articles		
			Positive	Negative	Neutral
A Terrorism	45	21(46.66%)	13(28.88%)	0(0.00%)	8(17.77%)
B Drone Attacks	45	4(8.88%)	4(8.88%)	0(0.00%)	0(0.00%)
C Politics	45	4(8.88%)	2(4.44%)	0(0.00%)	2(4.44%)
D Mixed	45	16(35.33%)	6(13.33%)	0(0.00%)	10(22.22%)
Total	45	45(100%)	25(55.55%)	0	20 (44.44%)

As compare to (VOA) depiction of Pakistan is not dreadful by Al-Jazeera news organization. According to table 2; that meddle eastern news organization “Al-Jazeera” covered Pakistan as it is. Al-Jazeera covered 45 (100%) articles in which 25(55.55%) articles are positive, 20 (44.44%) news stories are neutral while there is no negatively framed news for Pakistan by Al-Jazeera.

Calculations of one month news stuff covered by Al-Jazeera in category A, Table 2; showed that article related to terrorism is 21(46.66%) in which 13(28.88%) articles are positive ,8(17.77%) coded as neutrally while non of news article is placed in negative category. Table 2; illustrate that Al-Jazeera reported 45 news articles about Pakistan in February in which 4(8.88%) articles are categories in B and all are coded as positive.

According to table 2; Al-Jazeera covered total 4(8.88%) articles in category C, in this category 2(4.44%) articles are categorised positively, 2(4.44%) neutral while there is no negative news article published by Al-Jazeera in which they try to show Pakistan as downwards country.

Category D is related to general articles like religious, culture. It is clearly showed that Al-Jazeera covered 16(35.33%) news articles in which 6(13.33%) are positive, 10(22.22%) are neutral while there is no such a news article which depict Pakistan as a bad place. Cumulative of the result showed that there is major relation of positive image of Pakistan. The agenda of Al-Jazeera is quite deferent than (VOA)'s agenda for Pakistan.

4.1 Findings and Discussions

Altogether, 92 articles were found relevant to Pakistan out of 92 news articles Al-Jazeera news organization covered 45 articles during February 2014 period while (VOA) published 47 articles on terrorism, politics, drones and some mixed news during the same period. It was also noted that Al-Jazeera published on the topic of terrorism with longer gaps while (VOA) devoted one or two articles daily on terrorism. Al-Jazeera devoted about all social issue while (VOA) is interested in Taliban and militant in Pakistan. Result showed that Al-Jazeera was devoted greater space to anti drones attacks and other social issues while (VOA) covered only one news story about drone attack. By examining language and theme of the article, as how the articles presented whether it is positive, negative or neutral.

The researcher finds a clear line of positive theme that hints the agenda setting techniques adopted by Al-Jazeera as it published 45 articles in which 25(55.55%) is positive 0 (0.00%) is negative and 20 (44.44%) were neutral, while during the same period (VOA) produced 47 articles in which 6(12.76%) were positive, 8(17.02%) were neutral and 33(70.21%) is completely negatively reported. A number of articles reflect the framing in the discourse analysis Al-Jazeera actively boosted pro-Pakistan by publishing more positive news than anti-Pakistan elements. AL-Jazeera covered Pakistan gatherings in a neutral and cautious way by keeping him neutral and objective in most of its articles.

5. Conclusion

Data collected from the field was presented and analyzed in part four. This section however, summaries the research findings and makes recommendations based on these findings. According to the above tables comparisons this study finds out that American media (VOA) is quite different than Al-Jazeera in disseminating information. Depiction of Pakistan by Al-Jazeera is constantly neutral and positive in one month Al-Jazeera covered news about Pakistan in 45 articles in which 25(55.55%) news articles was positive, 20 (44.44%) neutral while there was no negative news story about Pakistan.

In the light of this research article American news organization (VOA) illustrates Pakistan as an unsuccessful state against war on terror and had the opinion that Pakistan is a place for terrorist. (VOA) covered 47 (100%) articles in which 33(70.21%) articles portray the negative image of

Pakistan 6(12.76%) news articles are categories in positive while 8(17.02%) news articles are neutrally reported. Mostly these news articles are about Taliban, terrorists, militants; religious extremism one news story about drone attack while in whole month time (VOA) couldn't give a little space for other issues in Pakistan like health, education other developments and especially anti drone protests. (VOA) used the word "Taliban" 269 times in one month while Al-Jazeera used the same word 137 times. The word militant was used by (VOA) 109 times while Al-Jazeera used the same word only 8 times in whole month. According to Al-Jazeera agenda the word drone used 38 times and all the news about anti drones attacks while (VOA) cover only one news story about drone attack and claimed that leader of Taliban killed in that attack. According to this research study (VOA) is repeating the word "Taliban" and "militants" and trying to link all these terrors with Pakistan, while Al-Jazeera is neutral and portray the good picture of Pakistan.

5.1 Further Recommendations

In the light of this research study the following recommendations are made: This research study has thrown up many questions in need of further investigation. Further work needs to be done to investigate whether other western news organizations are farming and propagating Pakistan as a bad place? More broadly, research is also needed to determine that English media will be partial and how the government of Pakistan will take action against their propaganda and deferent agendas.

More information on "depiction of Pakistan by (VOA) and Al-Jazeera" would help us to establish a greater degree of accuracy on this matter. These findings provide the following insights for future research: Considerably more work will need to be done to determine and compare other media organizations and the other aspects of media's propaganda. It would be interesting to compare experiences of individuals within the same group.

References

- [1] Amir Khan Goraya, (11th January 2010), concurrent list: 1973 constitution and recent political developments, p.4.
- [2] Edward I. Bernays (1928), Propaganda, p.153.
- [3] Eleanor Chelimsky (March 1989) Content Analysis: A Methodology for Structuring and Analyzing Written Material, United States, General Accounting Office.
- [4] Goffman, E. (1974). Frame analysis, free press.
- [5] <http://www.globalresearch.ca/setting-the-stage-for-war-with-pakistan/5378649?print=1>
- [6] <http://www.marketoracle.co.uk/Article45304.html>
- [7] International Media Support July, (2009), Published in Denmark by IMS, p. 11.
- [8] McCombs (1972). The Agenda-Setting Role of the Mass Media in the Shaping of Public Opinion, University of Texas at Austin.
- [9] Miller, K. (2004). Communication Theories: Perspectives, Processes, and Contexts, New York, McGraw-Hill
- [10] Poornananda, D. S. (1998). Coverage of South Asia in two leading U.S. newspapers. Media Asia.

- [11] Sarantakos, S. (1998). Social research. Hampshire, London: Macmillian press.
- [12] Tomaselli, Keyan, (1992), Communication or Propaganda. What's the Difference? Published: In Innovation, p. 4.
- [13] Ziad Haider, (2010), The ideological struggle for pakistan, Board of Trustees of the Leland Stanford Junior University, p.1.
- [14] <http://www.nation.com.pk/national/21-Nov-2013/first-us-drone-strike-in-kpk-kills-five>.
- [15] <http://www.journeyman.tv/?lid=66218&bid=2>